

MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 30, 2013 PUBLIC MEETING OF THE ARIZONA NATURAL RESOURCES REVIEW COUNCIL

1. **Call to Order- Welcome and Introductions**

Chairman Larry Voyles called the meeting to order at 1:00 pm and welcomed the Council to the public meeting of the Natural Resources Review Council. Council members in attendance included:

AZ Department of Transportation (ADOT) – Floyd Roehrich
AZ State Land Department (ASLD) – Vanessa Hickman
AZ Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ) –Henry Darwin
AZ Department of Water Resources (ADWR) – Sandy Fabritz-Whitney
AZ State Forester (ASF) –Scott Hunt
AZ Geological Survey (AGS) – Nyal Niemuth for Lee Allison
AZ Department of Agriculture (ADA) – Brett Cameron for Don Butler
AZ State Parks (ASP) – Bryan Martin

Others Present in Support of the Council:

Governor's Office – Jill Hall (OSPB)
AGFD – Bob Broscheid

2. **Review Agenda**

No requests for changes to the agenda were identified by the Council. The Council was notified that the Governor will be briefing her Cabinet Agencies on the federal shutdown and will need the Council meeting to conclude by 3:00pm.

3. **Council Update on Subcommittee Work**

Geographic Information System Subcommittee (Lee Allison)

Nyal Niemuth (for Director Allison) briefed the Council on the GIS Subcommittee's progress in completing the work plan of activities. The SC will continue to focus its efforts on creating the GIS module platform and has addressed the Council members' concerns about having the resources and technical expertise allocated for developing an overarching decision support system at this time.

Clearinghouse Development Subcommittee (B. Broscheid)

Mr. Broscheid provided a brief update on the SC's efforts on developing a module, consistent with the Council's previous direction on end-user requirements. AZGS will provide the technical expertise in developing the module and will provide oversight to ensure linkage to the GIS SC consistent with the direction provided by the Council. As discussed previously with the Governor's Office, the Office of Strategic Planning and Budget will be the Single-Point-of-Contact as required under the Presidential Order. As such, Mr. Broscheid provided a Draft Executive Order for the Council's review and comment. **Comments from the Council on the Draft EO are due to Mr. Broscheid by October 11th.**

Planning Subcommittee (Scott Hunt)

Mr. Hunt provided a Final Draft Request for Grant Application Notice to the Council for review and comment. The process for selecting and approving the grant, as described in HB2001, was described in the grant application. The Council discussed some minor

changes to the grant which were captured by Mr. Broscheid. With those changes incorporated, the Council approved the grant application for release and voted to direct the Planning SC to serve as the application reviewers and provide a recommendation to the Council for award.

Mitigation and Conservation Banking Subcommittee (Vanessa Hickman)

Ms. Hickman briefed the Council on the recent meeting of the SC. Steve Spangle (USFWS) provided an overview of the various programs within USFWS that either require mitigation (HCP, Section 7) or can prevent listings and provide landowners assurance (SHA, CCAAs). Mr. Spangle provided various examples around the state for each of these options and how each is systematically implemented. Mr. Broscheid spoke to the benefit these programs can provide to state and local planning objectives, and without it, we will be forced into a more reactionary, project-by-project approach to offsetting impacts to ESA species (HCPs and Section 7 consultation). Conservation banking has been typically associated with completion of mitigation requirements under HCPs (e.g., Las Vegas HCP example). Mr. Spangle suggested the use of Candidate Conservation Agreements (or CCA) for conserving species and activities on Arizona's State Trust lands. This approach includes federal, state agencies, local governments and private landowners in the process.

Sally Diebolt (USACOE) discussed the current Clean Water Act 404 permitting process and how impacts are assessed and mitigated through the in-lieu fee program. ACOE is preferential to applicants paying into an in-lieu fee program versus on-site or off-site mitigation. Attendees also discussed the complexity of establishing Mitigation Banks in Arizona for such purposes. The attendees also discussed the need for mitigation areas in the Phoenix metropolitan area since development continues to expand and will require offsetting impacts to waters of the U.S. AGFD has used its Wildlife Areas in the past, but has exhausted the use of available credits.

Engagement and Partnering Subcommittee (B. Broscheid)

Mr. Broscheid provided a brief update on the work of the SC and requested that for those agencies that have yet to provide their agency information to the SC so they can finalize the key messages in the presentation. **The Council requested that the SC present some key messaging slides from the agencies at the October 21 meeting.**

4. Call to the Public

Kelly Norton from the Arizona Mining Association was present and wanted to thank Mr. Broscheid for attending their last meeting.

5. Discussion of Process for Providing Council Recommendations

Mr. Broscheid provided a draft discussion paper for the Council's consideration regarding some factors that may be considered when making decisions on content and deadlines. Council members expressed a desire to discuss the process of recommendations and timelines with the Governor's Office. Mr. Broscheid will then develop a more specific framework for the Council's consideration at the October 21 meeting.

6. Review Action Items/Future Agenda Items

The following action items and future agenda items were identified:

- 1) The Engagement and Partnering Subcommittee make a presentation to the Council on the key messages portion of the outreach presentation. **(B. Broscheid)**
- 2) A future framework for developing and presenting the Council's recommendations will be discussed with the Governor's Office and presented at the October 21, 2013 meeting **(B. Broscheid)**
- 3) Council members will soon receive a doodle poll requesting input on future meeting dates. **(B. Broscheid will send request)**

7. Adjourn

The Council adjourned the meeting at approximately 2:30 pm.

Future meeting Dates (All meetings are scheduled from 1:00 pm – 4:00 pm)

October 21, 2013

Governor's Executive Tower
2nd Floor Conference Room
1700 West Washington Street
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Future Council Dates- TBD